

# ANNUAL REPORT <br> Per SCR 111 of 2007 

## BY

## LOUISIANA PATIENT'S COMPENSATION FUND

October 1, 2012


## $\mathfrak{S t a t e}$ af $\mathfrak{T l n u i x i t a n a}$

PATIENTS' COMPENSATION FUND

DIVISION OF ADMINISTRATION

September 27, 2012

Honorable David Heitmeier, Chairman, Senate Committee on Health and Welfare
Honorable Scott M. Simon, Chairman, House Committee on Health and Welfare
Honorable Dan Morrish, Chairman, Senate Committee on Insurance
Honorable Gregory Cromer, Chairman, House Committee on Insurance

RE: Senate Concurrent Resolution No. 111
Regular Session, 2007

## Dear Honorable Chairmen:

In accordance with SCR 111 of 2007, the Louisiana Patient's Compensation Fund Oversight Board (PCF) submits the attached annual report on the status of the PCF. The Resolution mandates a report that contains actuarial data showing growth rates, increases/decreases in exposures and assets, actuarial analysis of the financial health of the fund and the prediction of the unfunded liability be provided to the Legislature by October $1^{\text {st }}$ each year

Overall, the Fund continues to make progress in reducing the unfunded liability. The current indications show the PCF's level of assets to liabilities far exceeds the statutorily required minimum level. As of December 31, 2011, actuarially estimated liabilities were $\$ 777,000,000$ and assets were $\$ 669,576,202$, resulting in an unfunded liability of approximately $\$ 107,423,798$. This represents a decrease of $\$ 30,000,000$ in the unfunded liability from the prior year. As of August 31, 2012, assets were $\$ 742,708,467$ closing the unfunded gap based on year end liability to $\$ 35,000,000$.

As a result of recent legislative and actuarial reforms, rates were reduced for physicians and hospitals for fiscal years 2011 and 2012 and hospitals in 2013. Physicians will have a small increase in fiscal year 2013 effective September 2, 2012. All PCF surcharges are based upon the actuarial study by class and each class pays for its own losses. The current rate should still allow for further reduction of the PCF's unfunded liability by an estimated $\$ 20,000,000$ to $\$ 25,000,000$ and should come very close to being fully funded by the end of fiscal year 2013.

In 2011 the voters approved Constitutional Amendment No. 3 clarifying the Fund is not state general funds and the state is not responsible for its losses. In March of this year the Supreme Court ruled the Medical Malpractice Act and the cap for general damages contained therein to be constitutional. This ruling relieved the huge pressures and uncertainty placed upon the Fund and the health care providers of the state that have been looming for several years.

An investment consultant has been retained to advise the Board on increasing investment income to help keep rates lower for the health care providers and to further reduce the unfunded liability.

The total surcharges and filing fees last fiscal year totaled $\$ 166,173,853$. Investment income earned was $\$ 12,587,693$. The total for administrative and claims expenditures was $\$ 121,588,858$, which was $\$ 17,687,927$ below budget. The administrative budget for the current fiscal year is $\$ 4,749,081$ and the claims budget is $\$ 130,000,000$. The T.O. for the agency includes 3 unclassified positions and 47 classified positions. There are 9 Board members.

In accordance with Act 182 of the 2011 Regular Session, a copy of the report has been submitted to the David R. Poynter Legislative Research Library for distribution and record keeping. The PCF's website, doa.louisiana.gov/pcf, contains more information, including minutes from Board meetings, financial information and rate information.

The Board has made a commitment to continue to manage the PCF as efficiently as possible and to meet all statutory obligations relative to medical malpractice claims. Should there be any other information you feel would be helpful or any questions you may have, please do not hesitate to call.

## Sincerely,



Clark R. Cossé III, J.D.
Chairman


Ken Schnauder, CPCU, AIC
Executive Director
c: Members of Senate Committee on Health and Welfare
Members of House Committee on Health and Welfare
Members of Senate Committee on Insurance
Members of House Committee on Insurance
Members of Senate Committee on Judiciary A
Members of House Committee on Civil Law and Procedure

## LOUISIANA PATIENT'S COMPENSATION PCF

During the 1975 legislative session, Act 817 (R.S. 40:1299.41 et seq), was passed which created the Louisiana Patient's Compensation Fund (PCF) to provide coverage to private health care providers in Louisiana. The purpose of Act 817 is to ensure that a stable and affordable market exists for malpractice insurance and thereby affording practitioners in the state an affordable and reliable cover for their claims and to provide claimants with a reliable and solvent fund for redress of their injuries. The original Act provided a statutory cap on total liability of \$500,000. It also provided for the Medical Review Panel process, which is the first step in pursuing a claim against a health care provider and provides patients and providers with a required and early nonbinding opinion as to the claim.

In 1984, the statute was amended to allow for the payment of all related medical expenses. This change allowed those patients with more severe injuries to have medical expenses paid by the PCF on an ongoing basis. This provision also reduces the payments that were being made or could have been made by Medicare and Medicaid, which lessens the burden to these programs.

In the 1990 legislative session, the statute was revised to create the Patient's Compensation Fund Oversight Board (Board). The creation of the Board gave providers greater input, and also greater responsibility, in the operation of the PCF, since members are from the provider groups that pay into the PCF.

The financial status of the PCF has significantly improved since 1990 under the leadership of the Board. There were large premium increases over the past 20 years to ensure the fiscal integrity of the PCF. From 1990 to present, there were 17 rate increases, resulting rates going up by about $540 \%$.

Health care providers who choose to enroll in the PCF remain responsible for the first $\$ 100,000$ of each claim, either through an insurance company or as a self-insured provider. With the payment of the proper surcharge to the PCF coverage is provided for the second layer of $\$ 400,000$ plus all related medical expenses. Participation in the PCF is not mandatory. There are over 17,000 private health care providers enrolled in the PCF. Expert testimony has estimated the value of the PCF cover when including the value of medical payments to be over $\$ 1$ million.

An annual actuarial study is done to determine the adequacy of rates compared to current and expected liabilities. The recommendations of the actuary are utilized by the Board to establish the rates necessary to cover estimated liabilities for the upcoming year and to ensure the statutory asset level is maintained.

The PCF now substantially exceeds the mandated statutory minimum of assets to liabilities. The actuary has estimated the PCF's liabilities, both claims already filed and those expected to be incurred in 2012, at approximately $\$ 777,000,000$. Currently the PCF's assets are approximately $\$ 742,000.000$. The Board's actions have resulted in a steady and impressive increase in funds and a decrease in the unfunded liability, while at the same time attempting to keep surcharge rates at predictable and affordable levels for private health care providers. This effort is vital to this State as the Board continues to guarantee a source of medical malpractice coverage that is reasonable and thus encourages health care providers to continue to practice in Louisiana and serve our citizens.


EXECUTIVE OFFICE

July 13, 2012

From: Lorraine LeBlanc
Executive Director

## RE: New Rates for PCF effective 9/2/12

In accordance with the annual actuarial study, the PCF Oversight Board determined there was justification to lower the PCF surcharge rates for hospitals and CRNAs. Most other providers will see a small increase.

The actual percentages that will be incorporated as of $9 / 2 / 12$ are as follows:
Hospitals

| Nursing Homes | $+1.2 \%$ for Skilled beds |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | $+1.1 \%$ for Intermediate beds |
| Assisted Living | $+1.0 \%$ |

CRNA $-8.0 \%$
Dentist $+3.6 \%$

Advanced Practice Nurses $\quad+3.6 \%$ (Nurse Practitioner, Nurse Midwife, Physician’s \& Surgeon's Assistant, and Clinical Nurse Specialist)
Physicians Class 1A $\quad+1.0 \%$

Physicians Class 1,2A, 2,3,4,5,7,8 + 3.6\%
Physicians Class $6+6.2 \%$
Oral Surgeon $+3.6 \%$
The "other" classes will remain the same at $93 \%$ of the primary premium.
The minimum rate is still $\$ 250$.
The overall rate increase is $+1.3 \%$.

# October 1, 2012 

## EXHIBITS

## AND

## EXPLANATIONS

## Exhibit 1

## Unfunded Liability

Prior to August 15, 2010, the calculation of the Statutory minimum funding level found in La R.S. 40:1299.44.A.(6)(a) required a surplus of $30 \%$ of the total of the surcharges collected, expenses and reserves (estimated amount of exposures pending and occurred but not reported). The Fund met this requirement for the last several years. This formula treated revenue as a liability and thus the UAL was felt to be exaggerated.

The statute now requires the PCF to maintain assets sufficient to provide at least $30 \%$ of the actuarially calculated liabilities and eliminated the treatment of revenue as a liability. As of December 31, 2011, based on actuarially calculated liabilities, the Fund has $87 \%$ of the necessary assets to cover these estimated liabilities.

The chart shows the estimated PCF liability, according to annual actuarial reports, compared to the funds and investments held at the Treasurer's office. The difference would be considered the true estimated unfunded liability. These amounts are based on calendar year data. The UAL was reduced by $\$ 30,000,000$ in 2011.

## ESTIMATED LIABILITIES

(Claim \& legal reserves + IBNR)
12/2000: \$383,600,000

12/2006: \$737,500,000
12/2007: \$756,200,000
12/2008: \$738,000,000
12/2009: \$773,400,000
12/2010: \$771,400,000
12/2011: \$777,000,000

ASSETS
(Cash \& investments)
\$298,719,110
\$422,024,190
\$372,747,599
\$431,217,706
\$324,982,294
\$494,585,500
\$576,373,243
\$633,745,844
\$669,576,202
Unfunded Liabilities
(Difference)
\$253,275,810
\$364,752,401
\$243,414,500
\$197,026,757
\$137,654,156
\$107,423,798
*all figures as of December $31^{\text {st }}$ of each year.
As of $7 / 1 / 12$ assets totaled over $\$ 742,000,000$, showing a further reduction in the UAL

## Exhibit 2a \& 2b

## Financial Summaries

These two exhibits are documents that are put on the Board's website each month, along with the general minutes from each Board meeting. They show the monthly expenditures and collections, interest earned, and fund balance at the end of the month. These items, as well as other information, are on the Board's website as our part of being a transparent state agency.

## REVENUE

FY Gross Collection
FY Refunds Issued
FY Net
Prior Year Cash Carryover
YTD Interest Earned
YTD Net Surcharge Collected
YTD Net Filing Fees Collected
YTD Operating Expenses
YTD Claim Expenses
YTD Fund Balance

Operating Services - Budget:
Expended
Balance

Claims Settlement- Budget:
Expended
Balance

SURCHARGE
\$20,750,969
-\$104,712
\$20,646,257

FILING FEES
\$49,300
-\$4,000
$\$ 45,300$
\$734,262,614
\$1,352,515
\$20,646,257
\$45,300
-\$624,937
-\$12,973,282
\$742,708,467
\$4,749,081
-\$624,937
4,124,144
\$130,000,000
-\$12,973,282
\$117,026,718

## CLAIM SETTLEMENTS:

All prior Month Approved Claims Not Paid
\$1,075,432
Current Month Claims For Approval
\$5,428,311
Total
\$6,503,743

Monthly LAPCF Revenue Collections

| FISCAL YEAR | FY 2011-2012 | FY 2010-2011 | FY 2009-2010 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | NET Surcharge Collections |  |  |
| JULY | 10,768,513.58 | 12,084,783.10 | 13,359,268.43 |
| AUGUST | 10,983,620.08 | 11,214,908.22 | 8,272,904.31 |
| SEPTEMBER | 6,703,394.54 | 3,423,893.13 | 7,895,761.34 |
| OCTOBER | 17,066,163.49 | 17,335,203.33 | 18,096,458.97 |
| NOVEMBER | 12,601,419.50 | 16,387,794.91 | 12,498,979.06 |
| DECEMBER | 21,750,474.85 | 13,605,123.44 | 30,866,340.29 |
| JANUARY | 35,390,892.74 | 37,600,108.04 | 37,556,810.90 |
| FEBRUARY | 21,489,452.20 | 30,250,143.81 | 24,441,404.14 |
| MARCH | 2,486,861.13 | 1,764,064.27 | 6,652,337.80 |
| APRIL | 7,701,722.65 | 5,855,079.63 | 5,132,470.48 |
| MAY | 3,907,571.80 | 3,751,612.60 | 5,049,177.07 |
| JUNE | 15,004,766.26 | 14,379,345.65 | 16,951,293.97 |
| TOTAL | 165,854,852.82 | 167,652,060.13 | 186,773,206.76 |
|  | NET Filing Fee Collections |  |  |
| JULY | 26,200.00 | 23,500.00 | 26,300.00 |
| AUGUST | 25,500.00 | 22,650.00 | 26,000.00 |
| SEPTEMBER | 27,500.00 | 21,300.00 | 19,800.00 |
| OCTOBER | 46,500.00 | 22,000.00 | 23,900.00 |
| NOVEMBER | 25,700.00 | 25,750.00 | 21,400.00 |
| DECEMBER | 23,000.00 | 29,100.00 | 23,200.00 |
| JANUARY | 24,000.00 | 27,900.00 | 27,350.00 |
| FEBRUARY | 18,600.00 | 21,300.00 | 21,300.00 |
| MARCH | 25,100.00 | 32,950.00 | 25,200.00 |
| APRIL | 21,900.00 | 22,900.00 | 26,050.00 |
| MAY | 28,500.00 | 22,200.00 | 27,300.00 |
| JUNE | 26,500.00 | 26,900.00 | 21,250.00 |
| TOTAL | 319,000.00 | 298,450.00 | 289,050.00 |
|  | Monthly Interest Earnings |  |  |
| JULY | 861,957.28 | 671,944.25 | 481,795.00 |
| AUGUST | 548,818.50 | 634,635.50 | 804,606.92 |
| SEPTEMBER | 2,030,087.56 | 761,444.50 | 546,745.05 |
| OCTOBER | 1,183,326.00 | 512,175.00 | 542,812.00 |
| NOVEMBER | 1,104,292.00 | 1,250,095.00 | 431,587.11 |
| DECEMBER | 599,278.00 | 481,957.00 | 608,275.19 |
| JANUARY | 947,434.50 | 639,973.50 | 504,322.67 |
| FEBRUARY | 395,117.50 | 369,415.17 | 863,065.50 |
| MARCH | 1,290,201.00 | 1,353,190.42 | 608,317.50 |
| APRIL | 1,610,094.00 | 999,991.21 | 393,699.16 |
| MAY | 1,416,453.06 | 1,236,401.65 | 853,779.00 |
| JUNE | 600,634.00 | 594,076.00 | 815,258.00 |
| TOTAL | 12,587,693.40 | 9,505,299.20 | 7,454,263.10 |
| Total Collections | 178,761,546.22 | 177,455,809.33 | 194,516,519.86 |

## Exhibit 3

## Medical Review Panels

The number of requests for medical review panels received by the PCF during each calendar year is shown in this exhibit. As you will note, the numbers steadily increased from 1977 through 2000, then in 2001 there was a spike. This was the result of 750 filing dealing with prescribing a drug and all were dismissed within a year without payments by the PCF. In August 2003, a filing fee was instituted. Since that time there has been a decrease in panels filed. Hurricane Katrina also appears to have had an impact on the number of panel requests filed. Overall, the number of requests filed and the number of individual providers named in requests have decreased during the past five years. Frequency seems to have leveled out at this time. For each of the last five years approximately 1600 requests for panels have been filed.


## Exhibit 4

## Claims

The PCF claims staff is limited in what they can do relative to a complaint since the PCF is not involved in the initial litigation. The PCF only becomes involved if there is a settlement in which additional monies are demanded from the PCF or when a judgment exceeds the primary layer of $\$ 100,000$. Defense attorneys are only assigned when an adjuster is unable to reach a settlement with the plaintiff or when litigation or discovery through the court is necessary. Less than $1 \%$ of the PCF claims incur any defense costs. The working relationship between all parties helps to reduce legal costs associated with claims and often reduces the time necessary to complete the process and compensate the injured parties.

The claims report shows the number of claims open, closed, closed without payment, pending by year and future medical claims pending by year. It also shows the amount spent in legal defense costs and judicial interest. Updated reports are put on the PCF's website following the monthly Board meeting.

The pending claims in January 2004 totaled almost 12,000. Since then, the PCF started pushing harder to obtain the information necessary to close older claims. Often the claims had been closed for years, but none of the parties involved notified the PCF. Pending claims now stay under 5000. It generally takes about 2 years for a claim to complete the medical review panel process and an additional 2 to 3 years for a final conclusion of the claim. The PCF's goal is to shorten the timeframe by at least a year through increased communication and cooperation between the other parties and the PCF.

|  | Panel and Claim Report through August 2012 <br> Report Run: As Of 9/4/2012 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Claims and Panels - Opened and Closed |  |  |  |  |
|  | Past month | Average Month* | This year | Reserve Type |
| Panels Filed | 101 | 138 | 928 | Future Medical |
| Panels Closed | 102 | 122 | 927 | Litigation |
| Claims Opened | 101 | 122 | 877 | Medical |
| Claims Closed | 94 | 128 | 914 | Total |
| Claims Closed With Payment - 19 |  |  |  |  |
| *Average Month based on calendar year 2011 |  |  |  |  |
| Litigation and Interest Payment Breakdown |  |  |  |  |
|  | Past Month | Current Year | Prior Year Total |  |
| Interest | \$202,272 | \$2,303,113 | \$3,228,299 |  |
| Litigation | \$330,206 | \$2,273,290 | \$3,060,045 |  |
| Open Claims By Year Filed |  |  |  |  |
| Date Filed | Claims Open | Percentage of Total | Count at Primary Level |  |
| 1989 | 1 | 0.0\% | 1 out of 1 at Primary Level |  |
| 1992 | 3 | 0.1\% | 2 out of 3 at Primary Level |  |
| 1993 | 2 | 0.0\% | 2 out of 2 at Primary Level |  |
| 1994 | 3 | 0.1\% | 3 out of 3 at Primary Level |  |
| 1995 | 4 | 0.1\% | 2 out of 4 at Primary Level |  |
| 1996 | 4 | 0.1\% |  |  |
| 1997 | 6 | 0.1\% |  |  |
| 1998 | 11 | 0.2\% |  |  |
| 1999 | 22 | 0.4\% |  |  |
| 2000 | 28 | 0.6\% |  |  |
| 2001 | 38 | 0.8\% |  |  |
| 2002 | 61 | 1.2\% |  |  |
| 2003 | 80 | 1.6\% |  |  |
| 2004 | 104 | 2.1\% |  |  |
| 2005 | 141 | 2.9\% |  |  |
| 2006 | 211 | 4.3\% |  |  |
| 2007 | 209 | 4.2\% |  |  |
| 2008 | 351 | 7.1\% |  |  |
| 2009 | 565 | 11.5\% |  |  |
| 2010 | 1025 | 20.8\% |  |  |
| 2011 | 1347 | 27.4\% |  |  |
| 2012 | 708 | 14.4\% |  |  |
| Total Open Claims | 4924 | 100.0\% |  |  |

## Exhibit 5

## Claim Payments

The following chart show the payments made for the calendar years indicated. As shown, the number of claims paid and the total amount paid has increased. Delays in resolving claims by the primary parties (plaintiff attorneys, defense attorneys and insurance companies) often results in the PCF paying a substantial amount in interest, and unnecessarily delays compensation to the injured party. To avoid such increased costs, the PCF encourages mediations and joint settlements as a means of resolving claims expeditiously and reducing costs.


## Exhibit 6

## Future Medicals

The Act was amended in 1984 to "uncap" related medical expenses and benefits.
Currently the PCF pays ongoing medical expenses on 182 patients in the amount of approximately $\$ 1,734,000$ per month.

The PCF began using a fee schedule in November 2001 which has resulted in significant savings to the PCF at no cost to the patients or their families. The reductions by the PCF are born by the health care providers that are providing the services.

Medical expenses include not only physician visits, prescriptions and hospitalizations, but also handicapped equipped vehicles, specialized wheelchairs, adaptive computer equipment, home modifications, and payments to family members and others for providing care in the home.

Since the addition of unlimited Future Medical expenses, the PCF has paid approximately $\mathbf{\$ 2 8 4 , 0 0 0 , 0 0 0}$ in medical expenses.
10 Years of Past and Future Medical Payments

| Calendar Year |  | Past Medical |  | Future Medical | Grand Total |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2002 | \$ | 7,184,104.87 | \$ | 13,123,532.39 | \$ |  | 20,307,637.26 |
| 2003 | \$ | 6,920,993.57 | \$ | 14,545,453.49 | \$ |  | 21,466,447.06 |
| 2004 | \$ | 10,375,379.04 | \$ | 12,234,595.39 | \$ |  | 22,609,974.43 |
| 2005 | \$ | 8,200,622.63 | \$ | 13,108,269.64 | \$ |  | 21,308,892.27 |
| 2006 | \$ | 16,879,655.99 | \$ | 16,599,432.25 | \$ |  | 33,479,088.24 |
| 2007 | \$ | 16,912,980.12 | \$ | 13,733,611.02 | \$ |  | 30,646,591.14 |
| 2008 | \$ | 26,960,700.28 |  | 16,182,093.32 | \$ |  | 43,142,793.60 |
| 2009 | \$ | 27,077,706.73 |  | 17,474,868.20 | \$ |  | 44,552,574.93 |
| 2010 | \$ | 19,729,194.46 |  | 19,257,698.37 | \$ |  | 38,986,892.83 |
| 2011 | \$ | 20,700,324.00 | \$ | 20,808,070.00 | \$ |  | 41,508,394.00 |
| 10 Year Totals: |  | 160,941,661.69 |  | 157,067,624.07 | \$ |  | 283,863,810.54 |

## Exhibit 7a \& 7b

## Rates \& Enrollments

The Oversight Board assumed management of the PCF in late 1990. The results of the annual actuary studies have been done since that time resulting in significant increases in rates. Rate changes from 1989 to present have resulted in huge increases amounting to an increase of $540 \%$ in what private health care providers must pay for coverage. In 2010 the annual actuarial study revealed rates could be reduced for the first time. The decrease would still provide additional funds to further reduce the unfunded liabilities. The overall rate reduction for all classes of providers combined was $13 \%$ in 2010. The 2011 actuarial report revealed rates could be reduced further, although only an overall $4.3 \%$. This reduction still provided funds that would be applied to lower the unfunded liabilities. In 2012 the actuarial study indicated an overall increase of just $1.3 \%$ with the physician average increase of $3.6 \%$ and hospitals a $5.6 \%$ decrease.

It should be noted that the number of enrolled providers shown in the chart does not include medical support staff, such as nurses or lab \& x-ray techs, or individual providers if they are included in a group that work part-time, such as emergency physician groups. The actual number of health care providers covered by the PCF would be substantially larger if these providers were included in the totals.

## Sample Rates Over the Years (for PCF Layer only) <br> Occurrence Coverage

## Specialty <br> 1990 <br> 2007 <br> 2012

Hospital $_{\text {(per bed) }} \quad \$ 591$
Internist
2,261
\$ 2,843
\$ 2,836

Gen.Surg
7,856
28,294
28,735
OB/GYN
10,273
41,349 39,009

| $\stackrel{\circ}{\circ}$ | \% | 8 | $0$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

# Louisiana Patient's Compensation Fund 

For more information please go to www.doa.louisiana.gov/pcf

The PCF web site will contain the report to the legislature as mandated by SCR 111

For more information, you can also contact:

- Ken Schnauder, CPCU, AIC, Executive Director ken.schnauder@la.gov
Phone 225-362-5262
- Mr. Clark Cossé, J.D. PCF Board Chairman ccosse@lhaonline.org
Phone 225-928-0026


# Louisiana Patient's Compensation Fund <br> Annual Report per SCR 611 of the 2007 Regular Session 

October 1, 2012

This public document was published at a total cost of $\$ 100.00$. 25 copies of this public document were published in this first printing at a cost of 100.00. The total cost of all printings of this document, including reprints is $\$ 100.00$. This document was published by Louisiana Patient's Compensation Fund to provide the annual report in accordance with SCR 611 of the 2007 Regular Session under authority of La. R.S. 43:31. This material was printed in accordance with the standards for printing by state agencies established pursuant to R.S. 43:31.

